

This document is downloaded from DR-NTU, Nanyang Technological University Library, Singapore.

Title	Acetic acid effects on methanogens in the second stage of a two-stage anaerobic system(Main article)
Author(s)	Xiao, Keke; Guo, Chenghong; Zhou, Yan; Maspolim, Yogananda; Ng, Wun-Jern
Citation	Xiao, K., Guo, C., Zhou, Y., Maspolim, Y., & Ng, W.-J. (2016). Acetic acid effects on methanogens in the second stage of a two-stage anaerobic system. Chemosphere, 144, 1498-1504.
Date	2015-10-23
URL	http://hdl.handle.net/10220/40285
Rights	© 2015 Elsevier Ltd. This is the author created version of a work that has been peer reviewed and accepted for publication by Chemosphere, Elsevier Ltd. It incorporates referee's comments but changes resulting from the publishing process, such as copyediting, structural formatting, may not be reflected in this document. The published version is available at: [http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2015.10.035].

1 Acetic acid effects on methanogens in the second stage of a two-stage anaerobic
2 system

3 Keke Xiao^{a,b}, Chenghong Guo^{a,b}, Yan Zhou^{a, b*}, Yogananda Maspolim^{a,b}, and
4 Wun-Jern Ng^{a,b*}

5 ^a Advanced Environmental Biotechnology Centre, Nanyang Environment and
6 Water Research Institute, Nanyang Technological University, 1 Cleantech Loop,
7 Singapore 637141, Singapore

8 ^b School of Civil and Environmental Engineering, Nanyang Technological
9 University, 50 Nanyang Avenue, Singapore 639798, Singapore

10 * Corresponding Author. Tel.: +65 65921832

11 *E-mail address:* ZhouYan@ntu.edu.sg (Y. Zhou)

12 **Corresponding Author. Tel.: +65 67906813

13 *E-mail address:* WJNg@ntu.edu.sg (W. J. Ng)

15 **Abstract**

16 This study reports on biomass tolerance towards high concentrations of acetic
17 acid (HAc) within the system. Biomass from the second stage of a two-stage
18 anaerobic sludge digestion system was used for this study. Microbial community
19 analysis by 454 pyrosequencing highlighted hydrogenotrophic *Methanomicrobiales*
20 was the predominant archaeal population in the second stage (> 99% of the total
21 archaeal community). Second stage biomass degraded HAc up to 4200 mg HAc L⁻¹
22 without observable lag phase. However, at HAc-shock loading of 7400 mg HAc L⁻¹, it
23 showed a one day lag phase associated with decreased biomass activity. After
24 stepwise HAc-acclimation over 27 d, the biomass degraded HAc of up to 8200 mg
25 HAc L⁻¹ without observable lag phase. The dominance of *Methanomicrobiales* had

26 remained unchanged in proportion - while the total archaeal population increased
27 during acclimation. This study showed stepwise acclimation could be an approach to
28 accommodate HAc accumulation and hence higher concentrations resulting from an
29 enhanced first stage.

30 **Keywords**

31 Two-stage anaerobic system; acetic acid inhibition; acclimation; hydrogenotrophic
32 methanogens; pyrosequencing; biomass activity.

33 **List of abbreviations**

34	A	The acclimated biomass
35	AM	Aceticlastic methanogens
36	AMPTS	Automatic methane potential test system
37	ATP	Adenosine triphosphate
38	CSTR	Continuous stirred tank reactor
39	day	d
40	FID	Flame ionization detector
41	ΔG^0	the Gibbs free energy under standard condition
42	GC	Gas chromatography
43	HAc	Acetic acid
44	HM	Hydrogenotrophic methanogens
45	HRT	Hydraulic retention time
46	k	HAc degradation rate constant
47	MBT	<i>Methanobacteriales</i>
48	MMB	<i>Methanomicrobiales</i>
49	MSC	<i>Methanosarcinaceae</i>

50	MST	<i>Methanosaetaceae</i>
51	N.A.	Not available
52	OTUs	Operational taxonomic units
53	PBS	Phosphate buffered saline
54	ppt	parts per thousand
55	qPCR	Quantitative polymerase chain reaction
56	R ²	Regression coefficient
57	S	The unacclimated biomass
58	SAOB	Syntrophic acetate-oxidizing bacteria
59	TS	Total solids
60	VFAs	Volatile fatty acids
61	VS	Volatile solids
62	vs.	versus
63	VSS	Volatile suspended solids

64 **1. Introduction**

65 The anaerobic process has been considered a cost-efficient and sustainable
66 approach for high strength wastewater treatment and energy recovery. The process
67 comprises four steps - hydrolysis, acidogenesis, acetogenesis, and methanogenesis
68 (Li et al., 2012). The two-stage anaerobic system has drawn attention due to its
69 tolerance to higher organic loading rates, higher hydrolysis and acidogenesis
70 efficiencies coupled with increased energy recovery over the single-stage anaerobic
71 system (Nasr et al., 2012). In order to enhance the efficiency of the two-stage
72 anaerobic system, many studies have focused on optimizing hydrolysis and
73 acidogenesis reactions in the first stage to maximize the substrate availability for
74 methanogens in the second stage (Dugba and Zhang, 1999; Nielsen et al., 2004;

75 Aslanzadeh et al., 2014). However, improved hydrolysis and acidogenesis efficiencies
76 in the first stage could lead to accumulation of volatile fatty acids (VFAs), which are
77 potential inhibitors for methanogens at high concentrations. Until now, less attention
78 has been paid to examine the effects of hydrolyzed and fermented substances (e.g.
79 VFAs) generated in the first stage on methanogenic activities in the second stage.
80 During hydrolysis and acidogenesis, acetic acid (HAc) is one of the major VFAs
81 products, and it serves as a precursor for two-thirds of methane generation (Rincón et
82 al., 2008). However, high HAc concentration could inhibit methanogenic activity if it
83 exceeded the inhibition threshold. The study by Fukuzaki et al. (1990a) was among
84 the first few that investigated HAc effects on methanogens in single-stage batch tests,
85 and their results indicated the concentration of undissociated acetic acid was the key
86 factor affecting methanogenesis from HAc. Mawson et al. (1991) also reported that
87 increasing HAc concentration from 400 to 2500 mg L⁻¹ would reduce HAc utilization
88 rate in single-stage batch tests. More recently, Xiao et al. (2013) studied the inhibitory
89 effects of HAc on methanogens in a two-phase anaerobic process, and different HAc
90 effects on methanogens in the acid and methane phases were observed. To date, there
91 is still limited information on methanogens' tolerance to high HAc concentrations in
92 the second stage of a two-stage anaerobic system.

93 Lins et al. (2012) demonstrated acclimation feasibility to alleviate HAc
94 accumulation during the start-up of a single-stage fed-batch reactor, however, its
95 feasibility to alleviate HAc accumulation in the second stage of a two-stage system
96 was not reported. It has been noted the methanogen community in the second stage of
97 the two-stage anaerobic system would be different from the single-stage system
98 (Merlino et al., 2013). Hence, it would be necessary to also investigate the possibility
99 of acclimating biomass in the second stage to alleviate HAc accumulation. Such

100 investigation could also shed light on the underlying microbial shift and biomass
101 activity associated with HAc acclimation.

102 This study focused on HAc effects on biomass from the second stage of a
103 two-stage anaerobic system. Studies were carried out to determine the effects of
104 HAc-acclimation on methanogenic activities. The related biomass activity was
105 investigated as well to understand the acclimation process. Pyrosequencing and
106 quantitative polymerase chain reaction (qPCR) were employed to characterize the
107 methanogen profiles in the second stage, and during HAc-shock loading and
108 acclimation. Insights gained from this study were expected to provide guidance on
109 maintaining second stage stability as the first stage became more effective at
110 hydrolysis and acidogenesis.

111

112 **2. Materials and methods**

113 *2.1. Two-stage reactor set-up*

114 The two-stage continuous stirred tank reactor (CSTR) anaerobic system was
115 operated for 121 d. It had a 7.5 L first-stage reactor and a 42.5 L second-stage reactor.
116 The first stage was operated at 55 °C, pH 8.5 ± 0.3 and hydraulic retention time (HRT)
117 of 3 d, and the second stage was operated at 35 °C, pH 7.1 ± 0.2 and HRT of 17 d.
118 Seed sludge was collected from an anaerobic sludge digester at a local waste
119 reclamation plant. Feed sludge (pH 5.7 - 6), containing 25 ± 2 g total solids (TS) L⁻¹
120 and 20 ± 2 g volatile solids (VS) L⁻¹, was collected at regular intervals from the same
121 plant and stored in 4 °C cold room before use. Throughout the 121 d of reactor
122 operation, the accumulated VFAs distribution in the first stage followed the order of
123 HAc (49%) > iso-valeric acid (15%) > propionic acid (14%) > iso-butyric acid (7%) >
124 n-butyric acid (4%). In the second stage, there was no residual VFA. The average

125 HAc concentrations in the feed sludge, first and second stages were 576, 2782 and 0
126 mg HAc L⁻¹, respectively. The term acetic acid (HAc) used throughout this study is to
127 indicate the chemical species in all its forms (generic form), including dissociated
128 acetic acid and undissociated acetic acid. During the 121 d operation, sludge was
129 sampled at intervals from all reactors for salinity, volatile suspended solids (VSS) and
130 microbial tests.

131 2.2. Experimental design

132 2.2.1. HAc effects on biomass during HAc-shock loading

133 The experiments to investigate HAc effects on biomass from the second stage of
134 the aforementioned two-stage anaerobic system were carried out in 5 L fermentors
135 (BIOSTAT Aplus MO, Satorius, Germany) in batch configuration. 2 L biomass (VSS
136 =10.63 g L⁻¹) drawn from the aforementioned second stage was used as inoculum
137 with nitrogen sparged during the transfer process. From preliminary laboratory
138 experiments using automatic methane potential test systems (AMPTS) (Bioprocess
139 Control Sweden AB, Sweden) (Supplementary data: Fig. S1), the biomass showed
140 highest activity while incubated with initial HAc concentration of 2000 mg HAc L⁻¹
141 compared to other concentrations. Therefore, the baseline HAc concentration tested
142 was 2100 mg HAc L⁻¹ in this study. 2 L synthetic medium (Labib et al., 1992)
143 containing HAc was fed into the fermentors for initial HAc concentrations of 2100,
144 4200, 6400, and 7400 mg HAc L⁻¹ in the mixed liquor, respectively. Various
145 incubation periods were maintained for these batch tests in anticipation of HAc
146 degradation rates which might result. The test groups were designated as 2100S,
147 4200S, 6400S, and 7400S where "S" denotes shock-loading/unacclimated biomass
148 (Table 1). The fermentor system was controlled at pH of 7.0 ±0.2 with 2.5 N HCl and
149 2.5N NaOH. Temperature was set at 35 °C with continuous speed at 200 rpm. Sludge

150 samples were withdrawn for VFAs at predetermined intervals on a daily basis. Sludge
151 samples for both ATP and VSS tests were withdrawn at 0th d and 1st d. Sludge for
152 microbial tests (pyrosequencing and qPCR) and related VSS test were sampled at the
153 end after the depletion of each added HAc concentration.

154

155 2.2.2. *Acclimation of biomass*

156 Similarly, experiments to investigate biomass acclimation to HAc were
157 performed in 5 L fermenters (BIOSTAT Aplus MO, Satorius, Germany) in batch
158 configuration. 2 L biomass (VSS =10.63 g L⁻¹) drawn from the second stage was
159 utilized as inoculum. For feed substrate, the baseline HAc concentration for the
160 acclimation experiment was set at 2100 mg HAc L⁻¹ on day (d) 0. Additional HAc
161 was gradually fed into the fermentor on the 4th, 8th, 13th, 18th, and 23th d to achieve
162 HAc concentrations of 3700, 4100, 6000, and 8200 mg HAc L⁻¹ in the mixed liquor,
163 respectively. The time at which each HAc increment was dosed would depend on
164 when the previous HAc dose was depleted. For example, after the depletion of 2100
165 mg HAc L⁻¹, the mixed liquor was centrifuged (12857×g, 10 min) and resuspended
166 with 1×phosphate buffered saline (PBS) solution (pH=7.4) to make a total volume of
167 2 L. This was to avoid salinity accumulation during pH adjustment since it might
168 mask HAc inhibition (Li et al., 2012). Another 2 L nutrient medium (Labib et al.,
169 1992) containing 3700 mg HAc L⁻¹ was then fed into the fermentor on the 8th d. A
170 similar procedure was adopted with HAc concentrations of 4100, 6000, and 8200 mg
171 HAc L⁻¹. The test groups were designated as 2100A, 3700A, 4100A, 6000A, and
172 8200A where "A" denotes acclimated biomass (Table 1). The system was controlled at
173 pH of 7.0 ± 0.2, temperature of 35 °C and stirrer's mixing speed at 200 rpm. Sludge
174 samples were withdrawn for VFAs at predetermined intervals on a daily basis. Sludge

175 samples for both ATP and VSS tests were withdrawn at 0th d and 1st d. Sludge for
176 microbial tests (pyrosequencing and qPCR) and related VSS test were sampled at the
177 end after the depletion of each added HAc concentration.

178

179 *2.3. Physico-chemical analysis*

180 VFAs were analyzed with gas chromatography (GC) and a flame ionization
181 detector (FID) (Agilent Technologies Inc., USA). The sludge sample was centrifuged
182 at $12857 \times g$ for 5 min and the supernatant filtered through a 0.2 μm nylon membrane
183 filter. The filtered sample with 10% formic acid was added into a 1 mL vial at a
184 ratio of 9:1 (v : v). A detailed description of VFAs analysis can be found in (Xiao et
185 al., 2013). The calculation of HAc concentration is through multiplying molecular
186 weight (60.05 g mol^{-1}) by measured HAc mole number from GC.

187 For salinity measurement, the sludge sample was centrifuged at $5143 \times g$ for 5
188 min, and then was filtered through 0.45 μm sterilized nylon membrane filter
189 (Whatman, UK) (Walton, 1989). Salinity was measured with a conductivity meter
190 (Mettler-Toledo Ltd., Singapore).

191 ATP measurement had been used as a rapid and simple method for evaluating
192 total biomass activity (Shanmugam and Horan, 2009). The amount of ATP present in
193 the biomass would be proportional to the luminescence released from the reaction of
194 biomass with the reagent BacTiter-GloTM (Promega, USA). Dilution was made with 1
195 \times PBS buffer (pH 7.4) to ensure the samples could be interpolated within the standard
196 curve. 100 μL specific commercial reagent and 100 μL standard or sludge samples
197 were incubated on opaque-walled 96-well plates on an orbital shaker for 5 min. The
198 luminescence data was recorded with a plate reader (Infinite M200Pro Tecan, SciMed,
199 USA). The specific ATP concentration was normalized against VSS concentration

200 (Hwang and Hansen, 1998; Chen, 2000).

201 VSS tests were in accordance with standard methods (APHA, 2005).

202

203 *2.4. Microbial community analysis*

204 *2.4.1. 454 high-throughput 16S rRNA gene pyrosequencing*

205 Total genomic DNA was extracted from samples using a powersoil DNA
206 isolation kit (Mobio laboratories, USA). The 16S rRNA gene universal bacterial
207 primer set of 28 F and 519 R, targeting V1-V3 hypervariable region (Islam et al.,
208 2015) and 16S rRNA gene universal archaeal primer set of 517 F and 909 R, targeting
209 V4 - V5 hypervariable region (Wang and Qian, 2009) were used for amplification.
210 The pyrosequencing analysis of DNA samples was conducted by Research and
211 Testing Laboratory (Texas,USA), with details as described by Xiao et al. (2014).

212

213 *2.4.2. Real-time quantitative PCR*

214 DNA was extracted from the sludge sample with an automatic nucleic acid extractor
215 (MagNA Pure) in accordance with the manufacturer's protocol (Roche Diagnostics
216 GmbH, Germany). Total archaeal population was quantified with primers (787F and
217 1059R) and probes (915F) described by Lee et al. (2009) and Shin et al. (2010). qPCR
218 was conducted using LightCycler 480 (Roche Diagnostics GmbH, Germany). A 20
219 μ L reaction mixture was prepared in accordance with the protocol of LightCycler 480
220 Probes Master kit (Roche, Germany). The two-step thermal cycling procedure was
221 performed as follows: 1) 10 min denaturation at 95 °C, followed by 10 s denaturation
222 (55 cycles) at 95 °C; 2) 30 s combined annealing and elongation at 60 °C, and 10 s
223 cooling at 40 °C. The description for standard curves using representative strains can
224 be found in Kim et al. (2013).

225 3. Results and discussion

226 3.1. HAc degradation during HAc-shock loading and acclimation

227 The biomass was subjected to HAc-shock loading concentrations at 2100, 4200,
228 6400 and 7400 mg HAc L⁻¹. Fig. 1 shows there was a one day lag phase for HAc
229 degradation at shock loading concentrations of 6400 and 7400 mg HAc L⁻¹ (Fig. 1c
230 and Fig. 1d). There was, however, no observable lag phase for the unacclimated
231 biomass to degrade HAc concentrations at 2100 and 4200 mg HAc L⁻¹ during the first
232 day of incubation (Fig. 1a and 1b), with HAc completely depleted by 4 d and 6 d,
233 respectively. It was noted the HAc inhibition threshold in this study was higher
234 compared to the typically reported values (2000 - 3000 mg HAc L⁻¹) (Mawson et al.,
235 1991; Xiao et al., 2013). This may be related to the pre-exposure and acclimation of
236 biomass to high HAc concentration of 2782 mg L⁻¹ in the first stage.

237 Stepwise acclimation was performed by gradually increasing HAc concentrations
238 from 2100 mg HAc L⁻¹ until 8200 mg HAc L⁻¹ over 27 d. With such stepwise
239 acclimation, there was no observable lag phase in HAc degradation with each change
240 in HAc concentrations at 2100, 3700, 4100, 6000, and 8200 mg HAc L⁻¹ (Fig. 2). The
241 highest concentrations of 6000 and 8200 mg HAc L⁻¹ could be completely depleted in
242 5 d without observable lag phase (Fig. 2).

243 The lag phase details following HAc-shock loading and acclimation are as
244 summarized in Table 2. While there was no observable lag phase during the first day
245 of incubation, a zero-order linear relationship between HAc concentration and time
246 was observed. The HAc degradation rate constants (k) and regression coefficients (R^2)
247 are listed in Table 2. The HAc degradation rate after completion of acclimation at
248 8200 mg HAc L⁻¹ was higher than those achieved following acclimation at 3700, 4100,
249 and 6000 mg HAc L⁻¹, and all these HAc degradation rates were higher than the rate

250 shown by unacclimated biomass at 4200 mg HAc L⁻¹.

251

252 **3.2. Biomass activity during HAc-shock loading and acclimation**

253 Adenosine triphosphate (ATP) can be regarded as an indicator of biomass
254 activity (Lee et al., 2006), and it ubiquitously exists in all microorganisms (Hwang
255 and Hansen, 1998). All living cells use ATP to conduct the essential energy-requiring
256 reactions (Archibald et al., 2001). Hence, in this study, total ATP content was used to
257 indicate biomass activity under different conditions. ATP content measured in this
258 study included total ATP of all microbes.

259 When unacclimated biomass was incubated with 6400 and 7400 mg HAc L⁻¹,
260 HAc degradation was delayed during the first day of incubation. Therefore,
261 investigation of ATP content was focused on the first day of incubation, with
262 comparisons at the 0th d and the 1st d for both acclimated and unacclimated biomass.
263 As shown in Fig. 3, ATP content had increased from 0th d to 1st d while incubated with
264 HAc concentrations wherein there was no observable lag phase (2100A, 3700A,
265 4100A, 6000A, 8200A, 2100S, and 4200S). This correlated with HAc degradation
266 since it was an exergonic reaction coupled with ATP synthesis (Hattori, 2008).
267 However, at the higher HAc concentrations of 6400 and 7400 mg HAc L⁻¹ wherein
268 there was a one day lag phase in the HAc degradation (6400S and 7400S), no increase
269 in ATP content was noted during the same incubation period. Instead, a downtrend
270 from the start of incubation was noted (Fig. 3). This could be related to the reduced
271 biomass activity arising from stress from HAc accumulation during the first day of
272 incubation (Fig. 1c and 1 d). ATP synthesis had been negatively affected by the HAc
273 accumulation. The increase in ATP content in acclimated biomass at 8200 mg HAc L⁻¹
274 compared to decrease in ATP content in unacclimated biomass at 7400 mg HAc L⁻¹

275 during the first day of incubation suggested the acclimation strategy adopted could
276 likely maintain biomass activity in face of increases in HAc concentration.

277 Since the inoculum used in this study was a mixed culture, therefore, the direct
278 relationship between ATP and HAc inhibition could not be elucidated without
279 excluding the impacts of other non-HAc utilizing microbes. However, with the
280 evidence from this study, it could be suggested decrease in ATP content might be seen
281 as an early-warning of HAc accumulation with negative impact on the biomass.

282

283 **3.3. Microbial community profiles**

284 Bacterial and archaeal communities in the acclimated and unacclimated second
285 stage biomass were characterized with 454 pyrosequencing. Community richness
286 (Chao 1, ACE, and number of observed OTUs) and diversity (Shannon index) were
287 evaluated with the MOTHUR software (Supplementary data: Table S1 and S2). The
288 present study had focused on HAc effects on the archaeal community. The rarefaction
289 curves of these samples (Supplementary data: Fig. S2 and S3) approached asymptote
290 phase, but did not reach a saturation status, indicating more archaeal phylotypes
291 remained to be sampled. This maybe because environmental samples are usually
292 abundant with rare species (Ashby et al., 2007). The Good's coverage of 96% - 98%
293 showed a good sampling of the archaeal community (Lemos et al., 2011) (Table S1)
294 was achieved. The unacclimated biomass at 7400 mg HAc L⁻¹ (7400S) was found to
295 have lower Chao1 (64.36 vs. 144.79), ACE (68.47 vs. 197.78), and Shannon's index
296 (1.66 vs. 1.70) than at 2100 mg HAc L⁻¹ (2100S) (Table S1). This indicated high HAc
297 concentrations decreased the unacclimated biomass' microbial richness and diversity,
298 and this could subsequently impair system stability. On the other hand, higher Chao1
299 (148.13 vs. 64.36), ACE (150.93 vs. 68.47), and Shannon's index (2.00 vs. 1.66) were

300 observed in the acclimated biomass at 8200 mg HAc L⁻¹ (8200A) compared to the
301 unacclimated biomass at 7400 mg HAc L⁻¹ (7400S). This indicated HAc acclimation
302 restored microbial richness and diversity, and could alleviate the inhibition observed
303 during shock-loading.

304 454 pyrosequencing analysis indicated the aceticlastic *Methanosarcinaceae*
305 (MSC) and *Methanosaetaceae* (MST) were not present in the second stage, however
306 the hydrogenotrophic *Methanomicrobiales* (MMB) represented 99.3% of the total
307 archaeal population in the second stage, with minor presence of MBT (0.42%). The
308 presence of *Methanolinea* (78.1%) and *Methanoculleus* (13.8%) (Supplementary data:
309 Fig. S4), both belonging to the order MMB, were the dominant methanogens at genus
310 level in the second stage. The carry-over of MMB from feed sludge (99.7%), seed
311 sludge (99.8%), and the first stage (81.3%) (Supplementary data: Fig. S5) could be a
312 reason for MMB predominance in the second stage. The stress conditions in the
313 second stage, i.e. high salinity (8.79 ppt, ppt means parts per thousand), may be
314 another reason for this predominance since the hydrogenotrophic methanogens (HM)
315 were more competitive than aceticlastic methanogens at stress condition of high
316 salinity (> 6 ppt) (Hao et al., 2010; Krakat et al., 2010).

317 The strain AOR, *Thermacetogenium.phaeum* (strain PB^T), *Thermotoga lettingae*
318 (strain TMO), and *Clostridium ultunense* (strain BS^T) have been reported as
319 syntrophic acetate-oxidizing bacteria (SAOB) present in anaerobic systems (Hattori,
320 2008). In this study, the first three types of microbes could not be identified at genus
321 level. However, the genus *Clostridium* was 6.41% against total bacterial population in
322 the second stage population. The preponderance of the hydrogenotrophic
323 methanogenic (mainly *Methanomicrobiales*) and possible presence of acetate
324 oxidizers (*Clostridium*) might suggest HAc-methanization was driven by the

325 syntrophic acetate oxidation pathway in the second stage. However, further studies
326 were needed to trace HM and SAOB roles in HAc degradation with the stable carbon
327 isotopic signatures technique (Hao et al., 2011).

328 As shown in Fig. 1, biomass from the second stage showed tolerance up to 4200
329 mg HAc L⁻¹, which was higher compared to the typically reported values (2000 -
330 3000 mg HAc L⁻¹) (Mawson et al., 1991; Xiao et al., 2013). The predominance of HM
331 (MMB) could have helped accommodate high HAc concentration, since HM has
332 higher specific growth rate (Kim et al., 2013), less sensitivity, and better adaptation to
333 toxic and shock conditions than aceticlastic methanogens (AM) (Krakat et al., 2010).
334 Jang et al. (2014) report that HM dominated in the second-stage mesophilic bioreactor
335 (HRT=19 d, pH uncontrolled) of a two-stage system for sludge treatment provide
336 support. Hao et al. (2010) also reported HM dominated when treating sludge with
337 high salt content (> 6 ppt).

338 For the acclimated and unacclimated biomass, MMB still remained dominant in
339 proportion with 94.2% (2100S), 99.4% (4200S), 99.7% (7400S), 99.5% (3700A), and
340 99.6% (8200A) against the total archaeal community, respectively (Fig. 4a). The
341 genus *Clostridium* was 3.43% (2100S), 4.68% (4200S), 4.99% (7400S), 2.29%
342 (3700A), 2.30% (8200A) against the total bacterial community. Although the
343 proportion of MMB had remained unchanged in both acclimated and unacclimated
344 biomass, the 16S rRNA gene copy numbers of acclimated biomass were higher
345 compared to the unacclimated biomass (Fig. 4b), with 2.43×10^9 copies g⁻¹ VSS
346 (2100S) and 5.46×10^9 copies g⁻¹ VSS (7400S) in the unacclimated biomass increasing
347 to 8.15×10^9 DNA copies g⁻¹ VSS in the biomass during acclimation (3700A) and 1.90
348 $\times 10^{10}$ DNA copies g⁻¹ VSS in the biomass after completion of acclimation (8200A).
349 This increase in the archaeal population would be related with the higher HAc

350 degradation rates of the acclimated biomass at 3700 and 8200 mg HAc L⁻¹ compared
351 to the unacclimated biomass at 2100 and 7400 mg HAc L⁻¹ (Table 2) since more
352 energy would have been generated for biomass (i.e. archaea) growth with the higher
353 HAc utilization (Grady Jr et al., 2011). Although the HAc degradation rate after
354 completion of acclimation at 8200 mg HAc L⁻¹ was higher than those achieved
355 following acclimation at 3700 mg HAc L⁻¹ (Table 2), the specific HAc degradation
356 rate may be not necessarily increasing since the 16S rRNA gene copy numbers were
357 increased.

358 The stability of the two-stage anaerobic system is a current topic for
359 investigation in recent years since its superiority was often compromised by decreased
360 methanogen activity due to VFAs accumulation in the second stage (Schievano et al.,
361 2012). The tolerance of second stage biomass to HAc inhibition would be important
362 for overall stability of the two-stage anaerobic system. The stepwise acclimation
363 process could enrich an appropriate number of specific microbes, with increased
364 tolerance to the inhibition. For example, Lins et al. (2012) improved start-up
365 performance with stepwise acclimation to overcome high HAc inhibition (9000 mg
366 HAc L⁻¹). Chen et al. (2003) had increased the sodium concentration causing 100%
367 inhibition of thermophilic methanogen activities from 10.6 g Na⁺ L⁻¹ to 22.8 g Na⁺ L⁻¹
368 with stepwise sodium acclimation of 4.1, 7.1 and 12.1 g Na⁺ L⁻¹. The use of stepwise
369 acclimation in this study had also succeeded in accommodation of substantially higher
370 levels of HAc accumulation. This stepwise acclimation approach might be applied in
371 full-scale two-stage anaerobic plants by controlling the operational conditions, such
372 that HAc production in the first stage is increased “stepwise” so as to achieve
373 stepwise HAc concentration increase in the feed to the second stage. This may be
374 achieved by manipulating the loading rates and thereby providing opportunity for

375 enriching MMB.

376

377 **4. Conclusions**

378 In this study, biomass from the second stage of a two-stage anaerobic system
379 could degrade HAc up to 4200 mg HAc L⁻¹ without observable lag phase. The
380 preponderance of *Methanomicrobiales* (99.3%) and presence of *Clostridium* (6.41%)
381 were noted in the population in the second stage. The proportion of
382 *Methanomicrobiales* remained dominant (95 %) as methanogenic populations grew
383 during HAc stepwise acclimation, and possibly allowed for higher HAc degradation
384 ability to 8200 mg HAc L⁻¹. The results suggested the stepwise acclimation could be
385 an approach to accommodate HAc accumulation and hence higher concentrations.
386 The key to higher HAc tolerance within the second stage of a two-stage system would
387 be to develop conditions which allowed higher abundance of *Methanomicrobiales*
388 therein as the first stage became more effective at hydrolysis and acidogenesis.

389 **Acknowledgements**

390 This Research grant is supported and administered by Singapore National
391 Research Foundation.

392

393 **References**

- 394 APHA, 2005. Standard methods for the examination of water and wastewater, twenty
395 first ed. American Water Work Association, Washington, D.C.
- 396 Archibald, F., M éhot, M., Young, F., Paice, M.G., 2001. A simple system to rapidly
397 monitor activated sludge health and performance. *Water Res.* 35, 2543-2553.
- 398 Ashby, M.N., Rine, J., Mongodin, E.F., Nelson, K.E., Dimster-Denk, D., 2007. Serial
399 analysis of rRNA genes and the unexpected dominance of rare members of microbial

- 400 communities. *Appl and Environ Microbiol.* 73, 4532-4542.
- 401 Aslanzadeh, S., Rajendran, K., Taherzadeh, M.J., 2014. A comparative study between
402 single-and two-stage anaerobic digestion processes: Effects of organic loading rate
403 and hydraulic retention time. *Int Biodeterior Biodegradation.* 95, 181-188.
- 404 Chen, H., 2000. ATP as an indicator of biomass activity in thermophilic upflow
405 anaerobic sludge blanket reactor. *J Environ Sci (China)* 12, 380-384.
- 406 Chen, W.H., Han, S.K., Sung, S., 2003. Sodium inhibition of thermophilic
407 methanogens. *J Environ Eng.* 129, 506-512.
- 408 Dugba, P.N., Zhang, R., 1999. Treatment of dairy wastewater with two-stage
409 anaerobic sequencing batch reactor systems—thermophilic versus mesophilic
410 operations. *Bioresource Technol.* 68, 225-233.
- 411 Fukuzaki, S., Nishio, N., Nagai, S., 1990a. Kinetics of the methanogenic fermentation
412 of acetate. *Appl and Environ Microbiol.* 56, 3158-3163.
- 413 Grady Jr, C.L., Daigger, G.T., Love, N.G., Filipe, C.D., Leslie Grady, C., 2011.
414 *Biological wastewater treatment.* IWA Publishing, London.
- 415 Hao, L.P., Lü F., He, P.J., Li, L., Shao, L.M., 2010. Predominant contribution of
416 syntrophic acetate oxidation to thermophilic methane formation at high acetate
417 concentrations. *Environ Sci and Technol.* 45, 508-513.
- 418 Hao, L.P., Lu, F., He, P.J., Li, L., Shao, L.M., 2011. Predominant contribution of
419 syntrophic acetate oxidation to thermophilic methane formation at high acetate
420 concentrations. *Environ Sci and Technol.* 45, 508-513.
- 421 Hattori, S., 2008. Syntrophic acetate-oxidizing microbes in methanogenic
422 environments. *Microbes and Environments* 23, 118-127.
- 423 Hwang, S., Hansen, C.L., 1998. Evaluating a correlation between volatile suspended
424 solid and adenosine 5'-triphosphate levels in anaerobic treatment of high organic

- 425 suspended solids wastewater. *Bioresource Technol.* 63, 243-250.
- 426 Islam, M.S., Zhang, Y., McPhedran, K.N., Liu, Y., El-Din, M.G., 2015. Analysis of
427 microbial biofilm communities developed on granular activated carbon in oil sands
428 process-affected water treatment using next-generation pyrosequencing. *Appl and*
429 *Environ Microbiol.* 11, 04258-04214.
- 430 Jang, H.M., Cho, H.U., Park, S.K., Ha, J.H., Park, J.M., 2014. Influence of
431 thermophilic aerobic digestion as a sludge pre-treatment and solids retention time of
432 mesophilic anaerobic digestion on the methane production, sludge digestion and
433 microbial communities in a sequential digestion process. *Water Res.* 48, 1-14.
- 434 Kim, J., Kim, W., Lee, C., 2013. Absolute dominance of hydrogenotrophic
435 methanogens in full-scale anaerobic sewage sludge digesters. *J Environ Sci (China).*
436 25, 2272-2280.
- 437 Krakat, N., Westphal, A., Schmidt, S., Scherer, P., 2010. Anaerobic digestion of
438 renewable biomass: thermophilic temperature governs methanogen population
439 dynamics. *Appl and Environ Microbiol.* 76, 1842-1850.
- 440 Labib, F., Ferguson, J.F., Benjamin, M.M., Merigh, M., Ricker, N.L., 1992. Anaerobic
441 butyrate degradation in a fluidized-bed reactor: effects of increased concentrations of
442 hydrogen and acetate. *Environ Sci and Technol.* 26, 369-376.
- 443 Lee, C., Kim, J., Hwang, K., O'Flaherty, V., Hwang, S., 2009. Quantitative analysis of
444 methanogenic community dynamics in three anaerobic batch digesters treating
445 different wastewaters. *Water Res.* 43, 157-165.
- 446 Lee, C., Kim, J., Hwang, S., 2006. Optimization of adenosine 5'-triphosphate
447 extraction for the measurement of acidogenic biomass utilizing whey wastewater.
448 *Biodegradation* 17, 347-355.
- 449 Lemos, L.N., Fulthorpe, R.R., Triplett, E.W., Roesch, L.F., 2011. Rethinking

450 microbial diversity analysis in the high throughput sequencing era. *Journal of*
451 *Microbiological Methods* 86, 42-51.

452 Li, H., Li, C., Liu, W., Zou, S., 2012. Optimized alkaline pretreatment of sludge
453 before anaerobic digestion. *Bioresource Technol.* 123, 189-194.

454 Lins, P., Reitschuler, C., Illmer, P., 2012. Development and evaluation of inocula
455 combating high acetate concentrations during the start-up of an anaerobic digestion.
456 *Bioresource Technol.* 110, 167-173.

457 Mawson, A.J., Earle, R.L., Larsen, V.F., 1991. Degradation of acetic and propionic
458 acids in the methane fermentation. *Water Res.* 25, 1549-1554.

459 Merlino, G., Rizzi, A., Schievano, A., Tenca, A., Scaglia, B., Oberti, R., Adani, F.,
460 Daffonchio, D., 2013. Microbial community structure and dynamics in two-stage vs
461 single-stage thermophilic anaerobic digestion of mixed swine slurry and market
462 bio-waste. *Water Res.* 47, 1983-1995.

463 Nasr, N., Elbeshbishy, E., Hafez, H., Nakhla, G., Hesham El Naggat, M., 2012.
464 Comparative assessment of single-stage and two-stage anaerobic digestion for the
465 treatment of thin stillage. *Bioresource Technol.* 111, 122-126.

466 Nielsen, H., Mladenovska, Z., Westermann, P., Ahring, B.K., 2004. Comparison of
467 two - stage thermophilic (68 °C/55 °C) anaerobic digestion with one - stage
468 thermophilic (55 °C) digestion of cattle manure. *Biotechnol and Bioeng.* 86, 291-300.

469 Rincón, B., Sánchez, E., Raposo, F., Borja, R., Travieso, L., Martín, M.A., Martín, A.,
470 2008. Effect of the organic loading rate on the performance of anaerobic acidogenic
471 fermentation of two-phase olive mill solid residue. *Waste Manage.* 28, 870-877.

472 Schievano, A., Tenca, A., Scaglia, B., Merlino, G., Rizzi, A., Daffonchio, D., Oberti,
473 R., Adani, F., 2012. Two-stage versus single-stage thermophilic anaerobic digestion:
474 comparison of energy production and biodegradation efficiencies. *Environ Sci and*

- 475 Technol 46, 8502-8510.
- 476 Shanmugam, P., Horan, N.J., 2009. Simple and rapid methods to evaluate methane
477 potential and biomass yield for a range of mixed solid wastes. *Bioresource Technol.*
478 100, 471-474.
- 479 Shin, S.G., Lee, S., Lee, C., Hwang, K., Hwang, S., 2010. Qualitative and quantitative
480 assessment of microbial community in batch anaerobic digestion of secondary sludge.
481 *Bioresource Technol* 101, 9461-9470.
- 482 Walton, N.R.G., 1989. Electrical conductivity and total dissolved solids—What is
483 their precise relationship? *Desalination* 72, 275-292.
- 484 Wang, Y., Qian, P.-Y., 2009. Conservative fragments in bacterial 16S rRNA genes and
485 primer design for 16S ribosomal DNA amplicons in metagenomic studies. *PloS one* 4,
486 e7401.
- 487 Xiao, K., Guo, C., Zhou, Y., Maspolim, Y., Wang, J.Y., Ng, W.J., 2013. Acetic acid
488 inhibition on methanogens in a two-phase anaerobic process. *Biochem Eng J.* 75, 1-7.
- 489 Xiao, K., Zhou, Y., Guo, C., Maspolim, Y., Ng, W.J., 2014. Dynamics of propionic
490 acid degradation in a two-phase anaerobic system. *Chemosphere*
491 <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2014.09.004>.

492